

# Comparing Optimal Portfolios: Markowitz vs Single Index Models for IDX High Dividend 20 Stocks (2022)

Rampi Melati<sup>1</sup>, Asep Risman<sup>2\*</sup>

| Received: | 22.11.2023 | Reviewed: | 04.12.2023 | Accepted: | 22.12.2023 |
|-----------|------------|-----------|------------|-----------|------------|
|           |            |           |            |           |            |

#### Abstract

This study aims to implement portfolio models using the Markowitz Model and Single Index Model, and to qualitatively compare the portfolios formed by these two models. A quantitative descriptive approach is employed. The study focuses on a population of 24 companies listed in the IDX High Dividend 20 stock index for the year 2022. The optimal portfolio formation through the Single Index Model results in 5 candidate companies: ADRO (36.06%), BBCA (12.87%), BBNI (22.34%), BBRI (21.86%), ITMG (6.87%) with a return of 3.44% and a portfolio risk of 0.23%. Meanwhile, the Markowitz Model results in 6 candidate companies: ADRO (18.81%), BBCA (2.21%), INDF (20.25%), ITMG (12.75%), KLBF (40.82%), UNVR (4.86%) with a return of 2.89% and a portfolio risk of 0.10%.

Keywords: IDX High Dividend 20, Markowitz Model, Single Index Model, Optimal Portfolio

## 1. Introduction

Investment is the act of allocating money or capital in the present with the goal of generating profits in the future. Investment decisions typically involve managing funds over a specific period, whether short-term or long-term. Prior to making an investment, investors are expected to conduct analyses and calculations to ensure that the investment can yield optimal returns with minimal risks. One of the investment options available to investors is stocks. Stock prices reflect a company's value (Risman et al., 2017; 2021). Therefore, stock prices fluctuate in line with the developments and prospects of the respective companies. As such, investing in stocks can provide returns in the form of capital gains and dividend yields, but it also comes with associated risks.

Investors often employ diversification as a strategy to allocate capital with the aim of mitigating potential risks and maximizing returns. Diversification involves creating a portfolio by selecting a combination of specific assets in a way that minimizes risk without reducing the expected return.

According to Nurdianingsih & Suryadi (2021), a portfolio is a collection of stock investments that offer maximum returns within a specific level of risk. Optimal portfolios can be formed using various methods, including the Markowitz Model and the Single Index Model. The Markowitz Method creates an optimal portfolio by minimizing risk while determining the expected return, whereas the Single Index Model creates an optimal portfolio by maximizing the comparison between the expected return and the portfolio's risk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Magister of Management, School of Economics and Business, Universitas Mercu Buana, Jakarta, <u>rampi.melati@gmail.com</u> <sup>2</sup> School of Economics and Business, Universitas Mercu Buana, Jakarta, <u>asep.risman@mercubuana.ac.id</u>. \*Corresponding author.

Investors who make careful calculations are likely to choose an optimal portfolio by measuring the level of risk and the expected return associated with their investment portfolio. Therefore, this research utilizes the IDX High Dividend 20 stock index. In the stock market, the IDX High Dividend 20 stock index comprises stocks that consistently distribute dividends with high yields. Consequently, this study aims to apply portfolio formation models using the Markowitz Model and the Single Index Model. Additionally, it seeks to make a qualitative comparison of the portfolios formed using both models.

## 1.1. Stocks

Stocks represent ownership in a company or limited liability corporation. It can also be said that stocks are one of the most favored forms of investment instruments by investors. Apart from the advantages, stock investments also come with disadvantages such as capital loss, non-distribution of dividends, fluctuating prices in accordance with market mechanisms, suspension and/or delisting, and bankruptcy of the company (www.idx.co.id, 2023).

One of the reasons investors engage in investments is to obtain returns. Return is the result, income, or compensation from an investment. According to Jogiyanto (2017), returns can be of various types: Realized Return, Expected Return, Market Return Rate, and Risk-Free Return Rate.

# 1.2. Stock Indices

Stock indices are statistical measures that reflect the overall movement of prices selected based on specific criteria and methodologies and are periodically evaluated. The IDX High Dividend 20 stock index measures the price performance of 20 stocks that have distributed cash dividends over the last 3 years and have high dividend yields (www.idx.co.id, 2023).

# 1.3. Optimal Portfolio

According to Hadi (2013), a portfolio is a collection of investment instruments formed to meet a general investment objective. Stock diversification is done with the aim of minimizing risk without reducing the expected return. According to Jogiyanto (2017), an optimal portfolio is a portfolio that provides the highest combination of returns with the lowest risk.

## 1.4. Markowitz Model

The Markowitz method calculates optimal risk according to investor preferences, whether they favor risk (risk-taker) or are risk averse (Anam et al., 2021). The Markowitz Model is a portfolio determination model that emphasizes the relationship between investment return and risk. Markowitz is based on a mean (average) and variance (variability) approach, where the mean measures the level of return, and variance measures the level of risk (Hasbiah et al., 2022).

# 1.5. Single Index Model

As stated by Zubir (2011), the Single Index Model is a technique for measuring the return and risk of a stock or portfolio. This model assumes that stock return movements are only related to market movements. According to Jogiyanto (2017), the Single Index Model (SIM) describes the relationship between the return of each individual stock and the market return (Rm).

# 2. Methods

In this research, a qualitative descriptive method with a comparative approach was employed. The data used was obtained through a documentary study of secondary data. The secondary data in this study consisted of the closing stock prices, JCI (Jakarta Composite Index), and the BI-7 Day Repo Rate, for the research year, which was 2022. The population used in this research included companies that were part of the IDX High Dividend 20 stock index, totaling 24 companies during the 2022 period. Sample selection was conducted using purposive sampling, a sampling technique based on specific considerations. The sample in this research consisted of 16 companies, determined based on the following criteria:

- Companies consistently included in the IDX High Dividend 20 stock index in the year 2022.
- Companies that did not undergo stock splits during the research period.
- Companies actively traded and not subject to suspension by the Indonesia Stock Exchange during the research period.

# 3. Result

## 3.1. Calculating the Realized Return (Ri) and Expected Return (E(Ri))

Realized return is the profit or loss that has occurred from investment activities over a specific period. On the other hand, the expected return represents the level of profit anticipated by investors from their investments. The calculation of the realized return and expected return values is done using the following formulas:

| Realized Return:                          | Expected Return:                      |  |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|
| $R_{i} = \frac{P_{t} - P_{t-1}}{P_{t-1}}$ | $E(R_i) = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n R_i}{n}$ |  |

Based on the formulas above, the values of the realized stock return and expected stock return for each issuer are obtained as shown in Table 1.

| No | Stock | Realized<br>Return | Expected<br>Return | No | Stock | Realized<br>Return | Expected<br>Return |
|----|-------|--------------------|--------------------|----|-------|--------------------|--------------------|
| 1  | ADRO  | 0,59904291         | 0,04992024         | 9  | INDF  | 0,07556572         | 0,00629714         |
| 2  | ASII  | 0,04025791         | 0,00335483         | 10 | ITMG  | 0,75367083         | 0,06280590         |
| 3  | BBCA  | 0,17661536         | 0,01471795         | 11 | KLBF  | 0,27013472         | 0,02251123         |
| 4  | BBNI  | 0,34806957         | 0,02900580         | 12 | PTBA  | 0,36718334         | 0,03059861         |
| 5  | BBRI  | 0,20363876         | 0,01696990         | 13 | TLKM  | -0,05568346        | -0,00464029        |
| 6  | BMRI  | 0,37372510         | 0,03114376         | 14 | TOWR  | -0,00479444        | -0,00039954        |
| 7  | CPIN  | -0,03072653        | -0,00256054        | 15 | UNTR  | 0,21220358         | 0,01768363         |
| 8  | HMSP  | -0,10103779        | -0,00841982        | 16 | UNVR  | 0,16531891         | 0,01377658         |

Table 1. Realized Return and Expected Return

| No | Period                  | Realized Return Market |
|----|-------------------------|------------------------|
| 1  | January                 | 0,00754677             |
| 2  | February                | 0,03875949             |
| 3  | March                   | 0,02660663             |
| 4  | April                   | 0,02226875             |
| 5  | May                     | -0,01105890            |
| 6  | June                    | -0,03320593            |
| 7  | July                    | 0,00572098             |
| 8  | August                  | 0,03272375             |
| 9  | September               | -0,01919486            |
| 10 | October                 | 0,00825081             |
| 11 | November                | -0,00247604            |
| 12 | December                | -0,03257784            |
|    | Total Return (Rm)       | 0,04336361             |
|    | Expected Return (E(Rm)) | 0,00361363             |

Table 2. Realized Return Market and Expected Return Market

| Realized Return Market (JCI):                                | Expected Return Market (JCI):         |  |  |
|--|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| $R_{\rm m} = \frac{R_{\rm mt} - R_{\rm mt-1}}{R_{\rm mt-1}}$ | $E(R_m) = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n R_m}{n}$ |  |  |
|  |                                       |  |  |

Based on the formulas above, the values of the realized return market and expected return market are obtained as shown in Table 2.

# **3.2.** Calculating the Variance and Standard Deviation of Stocks, as well as the Variance and Standard Deviation of the Marke

Every investment instrument carries a different level of risk, and variance is used to measure the level of risk or deviation from the expected return. The larger the variance value, the higher the risk associated with the investment. On the other hand, standard deviation serves as a measure of how much deviation might be expected from the expected return value. The calculations for variance and standard deviation are done using the following formulas:

Every investment instrument carries a different level of risk, and variance is used to measure the level of risk or deviation from the expected return. The larger the variance value, the higher the risk associated with the investment. On the other hand, standard deviation serves as a measure of how much deviation might be expected from the expected return value. The calculations for variance and standard deviation are done using the following formulas:

Variance and Std. Deviation:

Market Variance and Std. Deviation:

$$\sigma_{i}^{2} = \sum_{t=1}^{n} \frac{\left(R_{i} - E(R_{i})\right)^{2}}{n} \qquad \qquad \sigma_{m}^{2} = \sum_{t=1}^{n} \frac{\left(R_{m} - E(R_{m})\right)^{2}}{n} \\ \sigma_{i} = \sqrt{\sigma_{i}^{2}} \qquad \qquad \sigma_{m} = \sqrt{\sigma_{m}^{2}}$$

Based on the calculation results, the variance and standard deviation values for each stock and the market are obtained as shown in Table 3.

## 3.3. Optimal Portfolio using Single Index Model

The optimal portfolio formed using the Single Index Model aims to maximize the trade-off between the expected return and the risk of the portfolio. Several steps are involved in creating a portfolio using the Single Index Model, including:

#### 3.3.1. Calculating Beta, Alpha, and Residual Variance

The calculation of Beta ( $\beta$ ) is used to measure the volatility of the realized returns of a stock concerning the realized returns of the market during a specific period. The Beta value is

| No | Stock        | Variance   | Std. Deviation |
|----|--------------|------------|----------------|
| 1  | ADRO         | 0.00870816 | 0.09331750     |
| 2  | ASII         | 0.00693135 | 0.08325475     |
| 3  | BBCA         | 0.00293296 | 0.05415678     |
| 4  | BBNI         | 0.00511509 | 0.07151987     |
| 5  | BBRI         | 0.00304055 | 0.05514120     |
| 6  | BMRI         | 0.00394313 | 0.06279433     |
| 7  | CPIN         | 0.00349678 | 0.05913360     |
| 8  | HMSP         | 0.00617307 | 0.07856890     |
| 9  | INDF         | 0.00234589 | 0.04843441     |
| 10 | ITMG         | 0.01578789 | 0.12564989     |
| 11 | KLBF         | 0.00167240 | 0.04089496     |
| 12 | PTBA         | 0.00924391 | 0.09614527     |
| 13 | TLKM         | 0.00307004 | 0.05540794     |
| 14 | TOWR         | 0.00295626 | 0.05437151     |
| 15 | UNTR         | 0.00805940 | 0.08977414     |
| 16 | UNVR         | 0.00545948 | 0.07388827     |
| 17 | Market (JCI) | 0.00053657 | 0.02316397     |

Table 3. Variance and Std. Deviation

considered to gauge the risk of the stock, particularly its systematic risk. The higher the fluctuation between the realized returns of the stock and the market, the higher the risk. On the other hand, Alpha ( $\alpha$ ) represents the portion of a stock's realized return that is not influenced by market changes. Beta and Alpha are used to calculate the Residual Variance ( $\sigma_{ei}^2$ ), where the residual variance represents the unsystematic risk that is unique to each stock. The formulas for calculating Beta, Alpha, and Residual Variance are as follows:

Based on the calculation results, the values of Beta, Alpha, and Residual Variance for each stock are obtained as shown in Table 4.

## 3.3.2. Calculating the Risk-Free Rate

In this study, the risk-free rate is determined using the average Bi 7-Day Repo Rate for the year 2022, as calculated according to Table 5.

|    |       | 1           |             |                   |
|----|-------|-------------|-------------|-------------------|
| No | Stock | Beta        | Alpha       | Residual Variance |
| 1  | ADRO  | 2.41024189  | 0.04121051  | 0.01182523        |
| 2  | ASII  | 2.89021829  | -0.00708937 | 0.01141351        |
| 3  | BBCA  | 1.62352826  | 0.00885111  | 0.00434727        |
| 4  | BBNI  | 2.41599115  | 0.02027529  | 0.00824705        |
| 5  | BBRI  | 1.43691155  | 0.01177742  | 0.00414841        |
| 6  | BMRI  | 1.68975284  | 0.02503761  | 0.00547518        |
| 7  | CPIN  | -1.13761940 | 0.00155040  | 0.00419120        |
| 8  | HMSP  | 1.20173215  | -0.01276244 | 0.00694796        |
| 9  | INDF  | -1.04877130 | 0.01008702  | 0.00293608        |
| 10 | ITMG  | 2.08578353  | 0.05526864  | 0.01812224        |
| 11 | KLBF  | -0.12699252 | 0.02297013  | 0.00168105        |
| 12 | PTBA  | 1.89666100  | 0.02374477  | 0.01117413        |
| 13 | TLKM  | 1.92184747  | -0.01158514 | 0.00505186        |
| 14 | TOWR  | -0.18228275 | 0.00025917  | 0.00297409        |
| 15 | UNTR  | 2.79139030  | 0.00759657  | 0.01224027        |
| 16 | UNVR  | -0.93042053 | 0.01713878  | 0.00592397        |

Table 4. Beta, Alpha, and Residual Variance

| Table 5. Risk-Free Rate (R <sub>f</sub> ) |                                    |          |  |  |  |
|---|------------------------------------|----------|--|--|--|
| No  | Period                             | BI 7-Day |  |  |  |
| 1   | January                            | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 2   | February                           | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 3   | March                              | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 4   | April                              | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 5   | May                                | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 6   | June                               | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 7   | July                               | 3.50%    |  |  |  |
| 8   | August                             | 3.75%    |  |  |  |
| 9   | September                          | 4.25%    |  |  |  |
| 10  | October                            | 4.75%    |  |  |  |
| 11  | November                           | 5.25%    |  |  |  |
| 12  | December                           | 5.50%    |  |  |  |
|   | Total                              | 48.00%   |  |  |  |
|   | Average                            | 4.00%    |  |  |  |
|   | Monthly Risk-Free Rate 0.003333333 |          |  |  |  |
| Source: Processing Results, 2023          |                                    |          |  |  |  |

Table 5. Risk-Free Rate (R<sub>f</sub>)

#### 3.3.3. Calculating Excess Return to Beta (ERB)

Excess Return to Beta is the difference between the expected return and the risk-free return on an investment, considering the Beta value. The formula for calculating Excess Return to Beta is as follows:

$$ERB_i = \frac{E(R_i) - R_f}{\beta_i}$$

Based on the calculation results, the values of Excess Return to Beta for each issuer are obtained, as shown in Table 6.

#### 3.3.4. Calculating Ai, Bi, and Ci

The calculation of Ai, Bi, and Ci is used to determine the Cut off Rate (C\*) for each stock. The values of Ai, Bi, and Ci are calculated using the following formulas:

$$A_i = \frac{\left[E(R_i) - R_f\right] \cdot \beta_i}{\sigma_{ei}^2} \qquad \qquad B_i = \frac{\beta_i^2}{\sigma_{ei}^2} \qquad \qquad C_i = \frac{\sigma_m^2 \sum_{j=1}^i A_j}{1 + \sigma_m^2 \sum_{j=1}^i B_j}$$

Based on the calculation results, the values of Ai, Bi, and Ci for each stock are obtained as shown in Table 7.

## 3.3.5. Determining the Cut-off Point (C\*)

The Cut-off Point (C\*) is the threshold value used to determine whether a stock will be included in the optimal portfolio or not. The value of C\* is the highest value of Ci among all the values calculated for each issuer in the previous calculations. Therefore, the C\* value used is the Ci value held by PT Adaro Energy Indonesia Tbk, which is 0.00403211.

## 3.3.6. Determining the Stocks Included in the Optimal Portfolio

Stocks included in the optimal portfolio are those with an Excess Return to Beta (ERB) value greater than the Cut-off Point (C\*). Additionally, the  $\beta$ i value must be positive to avoid negative proportions in the subsequent calculations. Based on these criteria, 5 stocks are identified as candidates for the optimal portfolio. More detailed information about the stocks included in the candidate optimal portfolio can be found in Table 8.

### 3.3.7. Calculating the Investment Allocation Proportions (Zi and Wi)

The calculation of investment allocation proportions is performed by determining the values of Zi and Wi using the following formulas:

$$Z_i = \frac{\beta_i}{\sigma_{ei}^2} (ERB_i - C *) \qquad \qquad W_i = \frac{Z_i}{\sum_{j=1}^k Z_j}$$

| No Stock Excess Return to Be |      |             |  |  |
|------------------------------|------|-------------|--|--|
|                              |      |             |  |  |
| 1                            | ADRO | 0.01932873  |  |  |
| 2                            | ASII | 0.00000744  |  |  |
| 3                            | BBCA | 0.00701227  |  |  |
| 4                            | BBNI | 0.01062606  |  |  |
| 5                            | BBRI | 0.00949019  |  |  |
| 6                            | BMRI | -0.00348801 |  |  |
| 7                            | CPIN | 0.01033135  |  |  |
| 8                            | HMSP | 0.00246628  |  |  |
| 9                            | INDF | -0.05670690 |  |  |
| 10                           | ITMG | 0.00919458  |  |  |
| 11                           | KLBF | -0.21469988 |  |  |
| 12                           | PTBA | -0.00420403 |  |  |
| 13                           | TLKM | -0.00194233 |  |  |
| 14                           | TOWR | -0.07872549 |  |  |
| 15                           | UNTR | 0.00374123  |  |  |
| 16                           | UNVR | -0.00030126 |  |  |

Table 6. Excess Return to Beta

|    | Table 7. Values of Ai, Bi, and Ci |              |              |             |  |  |
|----|-----------------------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|--|--|
| No | Stock                             | Ai           | Bi           | Ci          |  |  |
| 1  | ADRO                              | 9,49543595   | 491,26026963 | 0,00403211  |  |  |
| 2  | ASII                              | 0,00544259   | 731,88364596 | 0,00000210  |  |  |
| 3  | BBCA                              | 4,25168905   | 606,32162996 | 0,00172132  |  |  |
| 4  | BBNI                              | 7,52079994   | 707,76946518 | 0,00292472  |  |  |
| 5  | BBRI                              | 4,72337964   | 497,71181336 | 0,00200024  |  |  |
| 6  | BMRI                              | -1,81897290  | 521,49278300 | -0,00076261 |  |  |
| 7  | CPIN                              | 3,19016377   | 308,78466316 | 0,00146845  |  |  |
| 8  | HMSP                              | 0,51262576   | 207,85371561 | 0,00024746  |  |  |
| 9  | INDF                              | -21,24370373 | 374,62290487 | -0,00949094 |  |  |
| 10 | ITMG                              | 2,20728479   | 240,06381777 | 0,00104921  |  |  |
| 11 | KLBF                              | -2,05971545  | 9,59346323   | -0,00109952 |  |  |
| 12 | PTBA                              | -1,35341740  | 321,93325984 | -0,00061924 |  |  |
| 13 | TLKM                              | -1,42007299  | 731,11679142 | -0,00054727 |  |  |
| 14 | TOWR                              | -0,87953371  | 11,17215922  | -0,00046912 |  |  |
| 15 | UNTR                              | 2,38157891   | 636,57588163 | 0,00095253  |  |  |
| 16 | UNVR                              | -0,04402416  | 146,13202321 | -0,00002190 |  |  |

Source: Processing Results, 2023

Based on the calculation results, the values of Zi and Wi for each stock are obtained, as shown in Table 9.

### 3.3.8. Calculating the Expected Return Portfolio and Risk Portfolio

The calculation of the expected return portfolio and risk portfolio is used to determine the level of return and risk that will be obtained according to the optimal portfolio that has been found. The calculation of beta, alpha, expected return, and risk of the portfolio uses the following formulas:

$$\beta_p = \sum_{i=0}^{n} W_i \cdot \beta_i \qquad \qquad \alpha_p = \sum_{i=0}^{n} W_i \cdot \alpha_i$$
$$E(R_p) = \alpha_p + \beta_p \cdot E(R_m) \qquad \qquad \sigma_p^2 = \beta_p^2 \cdot \sigma_m^2$$

Based on the calculation results, the values of Beta, Alpha, Expected Return, and Risk of the Portfolio are as shown in Table 10.

### 3.3.9. Optimal Portfolio using Markowitz Model

The Markowitz Model aims to minimize risk while determining the expected return level. Based on the previous calculations, some stocks with negative expected returns (as seen in Table 1) are not included in the formation of the optimal portfolio using the Markowitz Model.

| Comparing | Optimal | Portfolios |
|-----------|---------|------------|
|-----------|---------|------------|

|    | Table 8. Values of Ai, Bi, and Ci |             |             |            |          |  |
|----|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|----------|--|
| No | Stock                             | ERB         | Ci          | C*         | Decision |  |
| 1  | ADRO                              | 0.01932873  | 0,00403211  | 0,00403211 | Optimal  |  |
| 2  | ASII                              | 0.00000744  | 0,00000210  | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 3  | BBCA                              | 0.00701227  | 0,00172132  | 0,00403211 | Optimal  |  |
| 4  | BBNI                              | 0.01062606  | 0,00292472  | 0,00403211 | Optimal  |  |
| 5  | BBRI                              | 0.00949019  | 0,00200024  | 0,00403211 | Optimal  |  |
| 6  | BMRI                              | -0.00348801 | -0,00076261 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 7  | CPIN                              | 0.01033135  | 0,00146845  | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 8  | HMSP                              | 0.00246628  | 0,00024746  | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 9  | INDF                              | -0.05670690 | -0,00949094 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 10 | ITMG                              | 0.00919458  | 0,00104921  | 0,00403211 | Optimal  |  |
| 11 | KLBF                              | -0.21469988 | -0,00109952 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 12 | PTBA                              | -0.00420403 | -0,00061924 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 13 | TLKM                              | -0.00194233 | -0,00054727 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 14 | TOWR                              | -0.07872549 | -0,00046912 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 15 | UNTR                              | 0.00374123  | 0,00095253  | 0,00403211 | -        |  |
| 16 | UNVR                              | -0.00030126 | -0,00002190 | 0,00403211 | -        |  |

Source: Processing Results, 2023

| No | Stock | Zi         | Wi         | Investment Proportion |
|----|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|
| 1  | ADRO  | 3.11778607 | 0.36055511 | 36.1%                 |
| 2  | BBCA  | 1.11296566 | 0.12870846 | 12.9%                 |
| 3  | BBNI  | 1.93170943 | 0.22339176 | 22.3%                 |
| 4  | BBRI  | 1.89054708 | 0.21863155 | 21.9%                 |
| 5  | ITMG  | 0.59417486 | 0.06871311 | 6.9%                  |

Source: Processing Results, 2023

This is consistent with the research conducted by Husni et al. (2023), where stocks with negative returns are not included as candidate portfolio components. Based on the calculations, 12 stocks will continue to be used in the formation of the optimal portfolio using the Markowitz Model.

## 3.3.10. Calculating Covariance Values

The calculation of covariance measures the extent to which two variables can change together. A positive covariance value indicates that the relationship between two variables is in the same

direction, while a negative covariance value indicates an inverse relationship between the variables. The calculation of covariance can be done using the formula below. The calculation is performed for all 12 stocks in pairs, resulting in a total of 144 paired data points.

$$COV(R_A.R_B) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{[(R_{Ai} - E(R_A).(R_{Bi} - E(R_B))]}{n-1}$$

| No  | Stock            | $\alpha_p$ | $\beta_p$  |
|-----|------------------|------------|------------|
| 1   | ADRO             | 0,01485866 | 0,86902504 |
| 2   | BBCA             | 0,00113921 | 0,20896183 |
| 3   | BBNI             | 0,00452933 | 0,53971251 |
| 4   | BBRI             | 0,00257492 | 0,31415421 |
| 5   | ITMG             | 0,06871311 | 0,00379768 |
|     | Total            | 0,09181523 | 1,93565126 |
| Ex  | pected Return Po | 0,03439872 |            |
| Ris | sk Portfolio     | 0,00231065 |            |

Table 10. Beta, Alpha, Expected Return, and Risk of the Portfolio

Source: Processing Results, 2023

| No                        | Stock | Investment Proportion |
|---------------------------|-------|-----------------------|
| 1                         | ADRO  | 8.33%                 |
| 2                         | ASII  | 8.33%                 |
| 3                         | BBCA  | 8.33%                 |
| 4                         | BBNI  | 8.33%                 |
| 5                         | BBRI  | 8.33%                 |
| 6                         | BMRI  | 8.33%                 |
| 7                         | INDF  | 8.33%                 |
| 8                         | ITMG  | 8.33%                 |
| 9                         | KLBF  | 8.33%                 |
| 10                        | PTBA  | 8.33%                 |
| 11                        | UNTR  | 8.33%                 |
| 12                        | UNVR  | 8.33%                 |
| Total                     |       | 100.00%               |
| Expected Return Portfolio |       | 0,02489880            |
| Risk Portfolio            |       | 0,00198344            |

Table 11. Optimal Portfolio with Balanced Investment Proportions

| Investment Proportion<br>18.81%<br>2.21% |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
| 2.21%                                    |  |
|  |  |
| 20.55%                                   |  |
| 12.75%                                   |  |
| 40.82%                                   |  |
| 4.86%                                    |  |
| 100.00%                                  |  |
| 0,028875571                              |  |
| 0,001004217                              |  |
|  |  |

Table 12. Optimal Portfolio with the Best Investment Proportions

Source: Processing Results, 2023

| No                             | Indicator     | Single Index Model            | Markowitz Model               |
|--------------------------------|---------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1 Stocks and                   |               | ADRO (36.06%), BBCA (12.87%), | ADRO (18.81%), BBCA (2.21%),  |
| Investment                     |               | BBNI (22.34%), BBRI (21.86%), | INDF (20.55%), ITMG (12.75%), |
| Pr                             | roportions    | ITMG (6.87%)                  | KLBF (40.82%), UNVR (4.86%)   |
| 2 Expected Return<br>Portfolio |               | 0.034398723                   | 0.028875571                   |
| 3 Ri                           | isk Portfolio | 0.002310654                   | 0.001004217                   |

Source: Processing Results, 2023

# 3.3.11. Calculating the Expected Return Portfolio and Risk Portfolio with Balanced Investment Proportions Assumption

The formation of the optimal portfolio with the assumption of balanced investment proportions is carried out by evenly distributing the investment allocation proportions to each stock included in the candidate optimal portfolio. Therefore, the investment proportion for each issuer is 8.33%. Based on the calculations, the expected return portfolio and risk portfolio with balanced investment proportions can be seen in Table 11.

# **3.3.12.** Calculating the Expected Return Portfolio and Risk Portfolio with the Best Investment Proportions Assumption

The optimal portfolio using the Markowitz Model can be formed with the assistance of the Excel Solver program available in Microsoft Excel. The Excel Solver program will determine the best stocks and investment proportions to achieve the highest possible expected return while minimizing the risk. Based on the results obtained from the Excel Solver calculations, 6 stocks are included in the candidate optimal portfolio. Subsequently, the calculation of the portfolio's expected return and risk is performed for these 6 stocks. The expected return portfolio and risk portfolio with the best investment proportions can be seen in Table 12.

# 4. Discussion

The comparison of results in this research can be observed from the stocks forming the optimal portfolio, the investment proportions for each stock, expected return portfolio and risk portfolio. A more detailed comparison of the optimal portfolio with the Single Index Model and the Markowitz Model can be seen in Table 13

Based on the analysis and calculations conducted, it can be concluded that the analysis of the formation of the optimal portfolio using the Single Index Model and the Markowitz Model results in different stocks and proportions. The Single Index Model result in 5 candidate stocks that form the optimal portfolio with proportions: ADRO (36.06%), BBCA (12.87%), BBNI (22.34%), BBRI (21.86%), and ITMG (6.87%). On the other hand, the Markowitz Model results in 6 candidate stocks forming the optimal portfolio with proportions: ADRO (18.81%), BBCA (2.21%), INDF (20.55%), ITMG (12.75%), KLBF (40.82%), and UNVR (4.86%).

The different stocks and proportions ultimately lead to different portfolio's expected returns and risks between the Single Index Model and the Markowitz Model. The Single Index Model results in an expected return of 0.03439872 (3.44%) with a portfolio risk of 0.002310654 (0.23%), while the Markowitz Model yields an expected return of 0.028875571 (2.88%) with a portfolio risk of 0.001004217 (0.10%).

# 5. Conclusion

Before embarking on stock investments, it is advisable for investors to conduct an analysis of the optimal portfolio, whether using the Markowitz Model or the Single Index Model. This analysis will provide valuable insights into the stocks that make up the portfolio, the allocation proportions, the expected returns, and the risks associated with the portfolio. It will help investors make better investment decisions.

For further research, it is recommended to conduct an analysis of the optimal portfolio using other stock indices such as LQ45, KOMPAS100, JII (Jakarta Islamic Index), or other relevant indices. This can provide a broader perspective for investors looking to invest in the Indonesian Stock Exchange. Investors should consider diversifying their stock investments and forming portfolios with the goal of reducing investment risk and achieving optimal returns.

# Bibliography

- Anam, S, K., Aprianingrum, A., Moorcy, N, H., (2021). Analysis of Determining the Optimal Portfolio with the Markowitz Model on the Jakarta Islamic Index (JII) Listed on the Indonesian Stock Exchange. Jurnal GeoEkonomi, Vol. 12, No. 02, 205-220. https://doi.org/10.36277/geoekonomi.v12i2.166
- Bank Indonesia. BI 7-day (Reverse) Repo Rate. https://www.bi.go.id/id/statistik/indikator/bi-7day-rr.aspx. Access on 2 October 2023.
- Hadi, Nor. (2013). Capital Market: Theoretical and Practical Reference for Investment in Capital Market Financial Instruments. First Edition. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.
- Hartono, Jogiyanto. (2017). Portfolio Theory and Investment Analysis. Eleventh Edition. Yogyakarta: BPFE

- Hasbiah, S., Anwar, Bado, B., (2022). Markowitz Model in Stock Investment Decisions on the LQ45 Index on the Indonesian Stock Exchange, Vol. 5, No. 1, 69-77. https://doi.org/10.26858/jekpend.v5i1.24709
- Husni, R, A., Samosir, T., Sindhuarta, S, J., Optimal Prtofolio Comparison Based on Markowitz and Single Model Using IDX BUMN20 Stocks during Covid-19. Jurnal Indikator, Vol.6, No.3, 94-104. http://dx.doi.org/10.22441/indikator.v6i3.15305.
- Indonesia Stock Exchange. Stock Index. https://www.idx.co.id/id/produk/indeks. Access on 1 October 2023.
- Indonesia Stock Exchange. Data IDX HIGH DIVIDEND 20. https://idx.co.id/id/data-pasar/data-saham/indeks-saham/. Access on 2 October 2023.
- Indonesia Stock Exchange. Paham. https://www.idx.co.id/id/investhub/paham. Access on 4 October 2023.
- Nurdianingsih, R., Suryadi, E. (2021). Comparative Analysis of Optimal Portfolios Using the Single Index Model and the Markowitz Model in Determining Stock Investments. Jurnal Produktivitas, Vol.8, No.1, 46-55. http://dx.doi.org/10.29406/jpr.v8i1.2875
- Risman, A., Salim, U., Sumiati, S., & Indrawati, N. K. (2017). Commodity prices, exchange rates and investment on firm's value mediated by business risk: A case from Indonesian stock exchange. European Research Studies Journal, 20(3), 511–524. https://doi.org/10.35808/ersj/725.
- Risman, A., Subhani, M., & Ushakov, D. (2021). Nexus between Financial Fundamentals and Automotive (Car) Industry. ARDL approach. E3S Web of Conferences, 244. https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202124408015.
- Yahoo Finance. Closing Stock Price. https://finance.yahoo.com/quote/%5EJKSE/. Access on 2 October 2023.

Zubir, Zalmi. (2011). Portfolio Management. Jakarta: Salemba 4